

Guidelines for the Selection of External Consultants

This document serves as a guide to assist in the selection of external consultants for the actions in the table below. External consultants must be approved by the Provost before solicitation.

Standing Faculty – Tenure Track	Standing Faculty – Clinician-Educator Track	Associated Faculty – Research Track
Appointment as Associate Professor (with tenure)	Appointment as Associate Professor CE	Appointment as Research Associate Professor
Appointment as Professor (with tenure)	Appointment as Professor CE	Appointment as Research Professor
Promotion to Associate Professor (with tenure)	Promotion to Associate Professor CE	Promotion to Research Associate Professor
Promotion to Professor (with tenure)	Promotion to Professor CE	Promotion to Research Professor

Provost Staff Conference (PSC) cases must be accompanied by the nomination of up to three external consultant nominations from the candidate and at least eight from the department/school. Once the nominations are approved, schools or departments shall solicit recommendations from the individuals selected by the faculty candidate and least eight selected by the department/school. A minimum of six external consultant letters from the names nominated by the department/school along with all letters received from the candidate list must be included in the final review packet sent to the Provost Staff Conference (PSC) for review.

External means Outside of the University of Pennsylvania:

- Current faculty or former faculty members who held an appointment within the last five years at the University of Pennsylvania are not eligible to serve as external consultants. An exception may be granted in the case where the candidate received their degree from UPenn and wishes to include their dissertation advisor or any member of the dissertation committee.
- For new appointments, naming colleagues from the candidate’s current institution is strongly discouraged.
- Candidates may use thesis advisors, colleagues, co-authors or collaborators, but should be kept to an absolute minimum and relationship must be disclosed.

General Recommendations for Candidate Selections

The candidate is strongly encouraged to select three consultants to be submitted by the department. These selections should be submitted to the department by the candidate before the department commits to their selections. If the candidate selects fewer than three consultants, confirm it is understood that they are entitled to three. See page 5 for templated text. The candidate may also provide information and reasoning for consultants they do not believe will give a fair review.

General Recommendations for Department and School Nominations

The selections should include *at least* eight consultants who meet the guidelines outlined in this document to be submitted by the department/school. Former Penn faculty members whose appointment was terminated more than five years from the nomination date are eligible, as long as there are no other close associations to the candidate. *A disclosure should be made stating that the consultant is a former Penn faculty member.*

- Ideally, consultants should represent an array of top tier institutions. No more than two consultants from the same institution should be nominated. *More than two consultants from the same institution may be approved **IF** they are in different schools or departments of the institution.*
- Direct association such as co-authors, former colleagues, co-organizers, co-editors, or editor of a book or collection in which the candidate contributed should be kept to a minimum (generally, no more than two consultants from the department/school proposed list) and must be disclosed to the best of your knowledge.
- If additional consultants are needed at any stage of the process, the same criteria and approvals are required.

The candidate should not be privy to the selections or involved in any discussion about the selection of department/school proposed consultants.

Academic Rank Requirements are based on the Candidate's Proposed Rank

- For Associate Professor actions (*promotions and new appointments*), the number of consultants allowed at the rank of Associate Professor is limited to two. All other consultants must be ranked at the Professor level.
- For full Professor actions (*promotions and new appointments*), all consultants must be at the Professor rank.

Consultant Qualifications

Stating simply that the consultant is an “expert” or “specialist,” or indicating the level of the consultant’s recognition (regional, national, international) in their given field without supporting the statement with facts is not sufficient.

To illustrate the point above, refer to the following samples for appropriate descriptors of consultants’ qualifications:

- Regionally, nationally or internationally recognized for making advances in ... (indicate the exact field of study)
- Member of consortium that provides services (indicate type) in the field of... (describe the specific area)
- Pioneered the ... (provide description).
- Discovered the ... (provide description).
- Member of the team that ... (provide description)
- President (or Chair) of ... (name of Society, Committee, etc.); include year(s) office(s) held.

- Editor of ... (state name of professional journal, etc.)
- Author of ... (publication related to area of expertise of the candidate)
- Winner of ... (prize or award in related area of expertise)

If selection(s) do not meet the recommendations above but the Department or School believes the consultant is essential in evaluating the candidate, an explanation for making the selection(s) should be included as a comment in the appropriate section of the form.

Contact with External Consultants

- Once the list is approved, the Department Chair, Personnel Committee Chair, or Dean may contact the external consultants to ascertain their willingness to review the candidate, although there should be no attempt to determine if the consultant is willing to provide a positive evaluation of the candidate's work.
- The Department Chair, Personnel Committee Chair, or Dean may delegate the task of contacting external consultants to a staff member.
- The Vice Provost for Faculty-approved solicitation letters should be used to solicit recommendations from the selected approved consultants.
- If a letter of evaluation has not been received by the stated deadline, the Department Chair, Personnel Committee Chair, or Dean may reach out to an external consultant for the sole purpose of determining whether the consultant intends to send the requested letter.

External Consultant Quick Guide	
<i>Submitted cases must include a minimum of 6 letters from the Department/School proposed list.</i>	
Candidate Proposed List	Should consist of 3 consultants
Department/School Proposed List	Must consist of at least 8 consultants
	No advisors
	Max of 2 collaborators, co-authors, colleagues, co-editors or editor of a book or collection in which the candidate participated
All Nominations (Both Candidate and Department/School)	Must be at the rank of Professors with the exception of a max of 2 Associate Professors being permissible for promotion to Associate Professor
	Max of 3 international consultants
	Max of 2 consultants from the same school with exceptions made if they are in different schools or departments
	No current Penn faculty
	Former Penn faculty members must have left the university at least 5 years ago
	Max of 2 from non-academic institutions
	Max of 2 emeritus professors – must be active

Template message to send to a candidate who selects fewer than three external consultants:

Hello _____,

I am ready to submit your External Consultant list to the Provost's Office for approval. Please confirm that you only wish to submit the names of two extramural consultants for your tenure review. You are entitled to submit three.

Please respond as soon as possible so that we may proceed with obtaining the Provost's approval for the list.

Thank you,