

Guidelines for the Selection of External Consultants

This document establishes expectations for the selection of external consultants for the actions in the table below. External consultants must be approved by the School Dean before solicitation. Prior to submitting a case for review by PSC, Schools will complete an “attestation form” in Interfolio, confirming that the External Consultants meet the University’s guidelines (see page 5).

Standing Faculty – Tenure Track	Standing Faculty – Clinician-Educator Track	Associated Faculty – Research Track
Appointment as Associate Professor (with tenure)	Appointment as Associate Professor CE	Appointment as Research Associate Professor
Appointment as Professor (with tenure)	Appointment as Professor CE	Appointment as Research Professor
Promotion to Associate Professor (with tenure)	Promotion to Associate Professor CE	Promotion to Research Associate Professor
Promotion to Professor (with tenure)	Promotion to Professor CE	Promotion to Research Professor

For each case in the table above, external evaluations must be solicited from up to three external consultants identified by the candidate and at least eight external consultants identified by the department/school. Before soliciting any external consultant evaluations, the list of external consultants must be reviewed and approved by the School Dean.

The final review packet sent to the Provost Staff Conference (PSC) must include all letters received from approved external consultants. The packet must include at least six letters from external consultants nominated by the department/school as well as all letters from external consultants nominated by the candidate.

Consultants are expected to be the foremost experts in the candidate’s field and come from the leading programs at institutions in the United States and other nations. The School Dean is responsible for ensuring that all approved external consultants are highly qualified to provide an evaluation and that the list of approved external consultants meets the expectations specified in this document.

The candidate should not be privy to the selection of the department/School consultants and should not be involved in any discussion about the selection of department/School consultants.

“External” means outside of the University of Pennsylvania

Current faculty or former faculty members who held an appointment at Penn within the last five years may not serve as external consultants. An exception may be granted if the candidate received their degree from Penn and wishes to include their dissertation advisor or other member of the dissertation committee on their list of external consultants.

Former Penn faculty members whose appointments ended more than five years before the nomination date are eligible. Status as a former Penn faculty member should be disclosed.

Up to two retired/emeriti faculty may be nominated, provided they are currently active in the field.

Expectations for Candidate Selections

The candidate should be strongly encouraged to select three consultants. The candidate should submit these selections to the department before the department commits to their selections. If the candidate selects fewer than three consultants, the department should confirm that the candidate understands that they are entitled to select three. See page 5 for templated text.

The candidate may include up to two thesis advisors, colleagues, co-authors or collaborators on their list of three external consultants. The candidate must disclose any relationship.

The candidate may also identify consultants they believe will not give a fair review.

Expectations for Department/School Selections

The department/School must identify *at least* eight consultants who meet the guidelines outlined in this document.

To the best of the department and School's knowledge, none of the external consultants identified by the department/School should be a current or former advisor, mentor, or supervisor of the candidate.

The department/School list may include up to two external consultants with a direct association. Direct associations typically include co-authors, former colleagues, co-organizers, co-editors, or editor of a book or collection in which the candidate contributed. Any direct association must be disclosed as accurately as possible. Departments, in consultation with the School Dean, are responsible for defining what constitutes a direct association in a given field.

Expectations for External Consultant Selections – Individually and Collectively

External consultants may come from universities in the United States and other nations.

- For new appointments, colleagues from the candidate's current institution should not be included in the list of external consultants.
- No more than two consultants from the same university should be nominated. More than two consultants from the same university may be approved if they are in different schools or departments.
- No more than two consultants from non-academic institutions or in non-academic positions should be selected. Schools may request that the Provost approve a list of non-academic institutions and non-academic positions from which external consultants may be selected.
- One of the two consultants from a non-academic institution or position may be selected with the goal of assessing the impact of the candidate's scholarship on policy or practice (including, for example, their community-engaged scholarship).

If additional consultants are needed at any stage of the process (to meet the minimum number of six external consultants identified by the department), the same criteria and approvals (for

individual consultants and the list as a whole) apply and are required. The candidate is not permitted to submit additional names if any on their original list declines.

Academic Rank Requirements are based on the Candidate's Proposed Rank

For Associate Professor actions only (*promotions and new appointments*), up to three consultants may be at the rank of Associate Professor, provided each has at least three years at rank. All other consultants must hold the rank of Full Professor.

For Full Professor actions (*promotions and new appointments*), all consultants must hold the rank of Full Professor.

Consultant Qualifications

Consultants are expected to be of high standing in their field. The department and School are responsible for ensuring that each identified external consultant has the required expertise and qualifications. The following are examples of ways to establish consultants' qualifications:

- Regionally, nationally or internationally recognized for making advances in ... (candidate's field)
- Member of consortium that provides services (indicate type) in the field of...(identify)
- Pioneered the ... (provide description).
- Discovered the ... (provide description).
- Member of the team that ... (provide description)
- President (Chair) of ... (name of Society, Committee, etc.); include year(s) office(s) held.
- Editor of ... (professional journal, etc.)
- Author of ... (publication related to area of expertise of the candidate)
- Winner of ... (prize or award in related area of expertise)

Contact with External Consultants

After the list is approved by the Dean, the Department Chair, Personnel Committee Chair, or Dean may contact the external consultants to ascertain their willingness to review the candidate. **There should be no attempt to determine if the consultant is willing to provide a positive evaluation of the candidate's work.**

The Department Chair, Personnel Committee Chair, or Dean may delegate the task of contacting external consultants to a staff member.

Only the Provost-approved solicitation letters may be used to solicit evaluations from the approved consultants.

If a letter of evaluation is not received by the stated deadline, the Department Chair, Personnel Committee Chair, or Dean may reach out to an external consultant for the sole purpose of determining whether the consultant intends to send the requested letter.

External Consultant Quick Guide	
<i>Cases submitted to PSC in the Standing, CE, and Research tracks must include a minimum of 6 letters from the department/school list of consultants</i>	
Candidate Proposed List	Up to 3 consultants nominated
	Up to two thesis advisors, colleagues, co-authors or collaborators
Department/School Proposed List	At least 8 consultants nominated; at least six letters received
	No known current or former advisors, mentors, or supervisors
	Max of 2 with direct association; School approves definition of “direct association”
All Nominations (Both Candidate and Department/School)	From the leading programs in the candidate’s field at institutions in the United States and other nations
	Rank of Full Professor, with up to 3 Associate Professors permitted for promotion to Associate Professor, provided each has at least 3 years at rank
	No current Penn faculty
	Former Penn faculty members must have left the university at least 5 years ago
	Max of 2 emeritus professors – must be active
	None from the candidate’s current institution
	Max of 2 from the same university unless in different schools or departments
	Max of 2 from non-academic institutions; School may request Provost approval of a list of non-academic institutions and non-academic positions from which consultants may be selected
	1 of the 2 consultants from non-academic institution or in a non-academic role may be asked with the goal of evaluating impact of the scholarship for policy and practice (including community-engaged scholarship)

Message to send to a candidate who selects fewer than three external consultants:

Hello _____,

I am ready to submit your External Consultant list to the Dean’s Office for approval. Please confirm that you wish to submit the names of only one/two extramural consultants for your tenure review. You are entitled to submit three.

Please respond as soon as possible so that we may proceed with obtaining the Dean’s approval for the list.

Thank you,

External Consultant Attestation Form

External Consultant Guidelines

Cases submitted to PSC in the Tenure, CE, and Research tracks must include a minimum of 6 letters from the department/school list of consultants

Candidate Proposed List

- Up to 3 consultants selected
- Up to 2 thesis advisors, colleagues, co-authors or collaborators

Department/School Proposed List

- At least 8 consultants selected; at least six letters received
- No known current or former advisors, mentors, or supervisors
- Max of 2 with direct association; School approves definition of "direct association"

All Nominations

(Both Candidate and Department/School)

- From the leading programs in the candidate’s field at institutions in the United States and other nations
- Rank of Full Professor, with up to 3 Associate Professors permitted for promotion to Associate Professor, provided each has at least 3 years at rank
- No current Penn faculty
- Former Penn faculty members must have left the university at least 5 years ago
- Up to 2 emeritus professors – must be active
- None from the candidate’s current institution
- Up to 2 from the same university unless in different schools or departments
- Up to 2 from non-academic institutions; School may request Provost approval of a list of non-academic institutions and non-academic positions from which consultants may be selected
- 1 of the 2 consultants from non-academic institution or in a non-academic role may be asked with the goal of evaluating impact of the scholarship for policy and practice (including community-engaged scholarship)

The External Consultant list and subsequent letters were solicited in accordance with the External Consultant Guidelines provided by the Office of the Provost. *

I attest